

Ukraine's 10 Point Peace Formula: Power or Powerless? #DAXUASummit

On June 11th, 2024, the Alumni Club of the Diplomatic Academy (DA), in collaboration with the Ukrainian Embassy, hosted a senior diplomatic and expert panel focusing on the 10-Point Peace Formula ahead of upcoming Summit on Peace in Ukraine in Bürgenstock, Switzerland. Ukraine's policy focus areas included nuclear security, food security, the humanitarian issues including return of illegally displaced children, as well as to build a common understanding for peace based on the UN Charter. The summit represented a preliminary step towards negotiations, where the ultimate goal was to establish a concrete roadmap for peace, within the confines of a bifurcated international security landscape in 2024. In the buildup to the meeting in Bürgenstock, Russia actively sought to dissuade countries from attending by means of threat or coercion.

Over 80 individuals attended the event, with the audience being composed of a diverse cross section of professionals including, diplomats, military officials', academics, current and former DA students, and members of the public. Throughout Russia's aggression against Ukraine, the DA has proven to be an important public platform to showcase solidarity and support for Kyiv.

Speakers

Welcome and introductory remarks: Martina Schubert (Deputy Director, Vienna School of International Studies), Vasyl Khymynets (Ambassador of Ukraine to the Republic of Austria)

Video message: Salome Meyer (Ambassador of Switzerland to the Republic of Austria)

Diplomatic and Expert Panel: Troy Lulashnyk (Ambassador of Canada to the Republic of Austria), Guna Japiņa (Ambassador of Latvia to the Republic of Austria), Robert Schuett (Chairman, Austrian Political Science Association ÖGPW; Non-resident faculty, Vienna School of International Studies)

Moderator: Roger Hilton (Board Member, club.da; Defence Fellow, GLOBSEC)



Panel Policy Takeaways

- The massive lack of credibility of institutions like the United Nations (UN) and their continued inability to work properly, such as no existing UN mechanism to stop, or rectify, the actions of a permanent sitting Security Council member from contradicting the UN Charter itself confirms this ongoing institutional dysfunction.
 - This phenomenon is one reason partly explaining why Russia launched its invasion of Ukraine.
- Despite the UN playing a critical role in the maintenance of international peace, actors like Russia continue to exploit its weakness that shows no tangible prospects of reform.
- Although transgressions continue to materialize when it comes to the applicability of UN principles, the formula for peace in 2024 is still grounded in the UN Charter's principles and guided by a system based on international law that respects both integrity and territory sovereignty for collective security.
- When the system is abused, as when Russia invaded Ukraine, holding actors accountable is essential to ensure that the system remains credible and to deter actors from pursuing similar future policy objectives.
- Holding Russia accountable is an exercise that must encompass three levels: state, regional, and global:
 - State level, allowing Russia to act with impunity—specifically, by forcibly dividing Ukraine through brute force—would hinder achieving a lasting and a just peace won't materialize; instead, the likelihood of frozen conflict lasting for years, even decades would be much greater.
 - Regionally, it would lead to instability, particularly in the Black Sea area, affecting food security.
 - Globally, permitting Russia to act with impunity would signal the death of the UN and the world order.
 - If the international community is incapable or unwilling to stop the war, the UN Charter loses its moral and legal weight.

- Previous experiences, like the impunity for Soviet crimes committed in Baltic states during the Soviet occupation, have proven that not holding aggressors accountable comes at great expense that must not be allowed to occur again. Consequently, if Russia is not punished for its actions this time around, it serves as a direct invitation for further aggression.
 - It was argued that Russian aggression was direct consequence of the Soviet Union not being held accountable for its previous crimes.

- As the UN is one the main pillars and arbitrators of international system, it remains in a challenging position, with a prominent trend emerging of actors looking to re-design its purpose and weaponize its extensive political bodies. Prior to Russia's annexation of Crimea in 2014, the international system was characterized by a competition and cooperation, but now the system is permanently deteriorating.
 - Russia's invasion of Ukraine is an example and symptom of a larger problem.
 - Unlike the Cold War, where select cooperation was possible in space or on arms treaty, the same zone for possible agreement is limited and continues to fade.

- Given that Russia's aggression against Ukraine remains active, holding Russia accountable as much as possible now is a worthwhile policy exercise that extends to allies utilizing legal, financial, and diplomatic means. The current options available include a multitude of mechanisms, such as the the establishment of a special tribunal to address crimes of aggression or the partial, or full, seizure of Russian national assets abroad.
 - There is widespread recognition of the horrific incidents caused by Russia and a growing awareness of the need for accountability to ensure similar atrocities are not repeated.
 - Establishing a special tribunal to address Russia's crime of aggression and war crimes, was also a matter of political will, not only legal obscurity.
 - It is of critical importance to pursue reparations for Ukraine now to address the economic costs inflicted by Russia.

- Although progress has been made on using Russia Central Bank assets as part of a larger reconstruction strategy for Ukraine, a policy gap remains on the final strategy between North American and European supporters of Ukraine.
- Concerns about potential Russian retaliation among European policy makers are especially pronounced that must be addressed by all parties.
- A core group of 40 countries are cooperating to develop a legal mechanism for accountability for the Russian crime of aggression and war crimes. The unprecedented nature of this situation in both legal and political terms, is a historic exercise that is addressing gaps in the international law system.
 - These collaborative discussions remain complex and are intertwined with a necessity to maintain a strong political will.
 - Recent steps are encouraging with a consensus emerging that a tribunal can be established based on a Treaty between Ukraine and the Council of Europe.

Audience Q/A

- Russia's rejection to attend the Swiss peace summit is a further sign of their genuine disregard for Ukraine's security and confirmation of their preference to use military instruments to satisfy policy objectives.
 - As Russia's wages a counter offensive, the value of their presence at the conference was not universally endorsed.
- The Swiss peace summit is one of many steps along the way to support Ukraine, where upcoming events like the NATO Leaders' Summit in Washington will provide additional venues to secure more support for Kyiv.
- The 10-Point Peace Formula is grounded in legality and is, from both a legal, moral, and security point of view, not controversial.
- The prospects of the Russian civilian population playing an active role to pressure President Putin to reign in his war effort are non-existent where the population has

either been co-opted to support the Kremlin, or too afraid to organize a dissenting movement.

- This war is not just a conflict between two parties but a fundamental struggle between autocrats and democracies.
- The urgency for democracies to stick together to protect democratic values within our respective societies has never been higher.
- Organizing a Russian democratic based movement outside of Russia is a challenging exercise given the fractured opposition and lack of collaborative muscle memory.
 - There is no consolidated Russian opposition currently, making it challenging to organize them effectively.
- There is a high concentration of opposition media in Europe, notably in Riga, which aims to support the Russian population towards democracy.
 - Russians living abroad have the freedom to act and express themselves, thanks to the democratic environments they reside in.
 - These individuals have the opportunity to take the initiative and mobilize for a different Russia should be inclined.
 - An audience member, originally from Russia, speaking from personal experience detailed the fear Russian expats haven when considering engaging in political activity that goes against the interest of the Putin regime.

Closing Comments

- The overarching mission of the summit was initiate the peace process, not reach a set of grand conclusions, where the confirmed high-level delegations, including state presidents and foreign ministers, already confirmed its success.
- The summit in Switzerland is a powerful path towards peace, noting that gathering provides an opportunity to present the 10-Point Peace Formula and focus on three key areas and signals to the international community that the plan is comprehensive and worth engaging with.

- Nuclear safety issues, notably Russia's dangerous actions at Chernobyl and Zaporizhzhia, the repatriation of Ukrainian children from Russia, as well as the global impact on food security, notably the global south's reliance on Ukrainian and Russian food supplies are interconnected themes, where addressing them together is an important outcome of the summit.

Policy Rapporteurs:
Roger Hilton
Benjamin Frommann